

Ethics in Labour: Hidden Human Rights in the Fast-Fashion Industry

Master in Human Rights & Migration Studies

Konstantina Papadopoulou

Supervisor: Dr. Nikolaos Zaikos



Table of Contents

- 1. Historical Framework
- 2. Legal Framework
- 3. Human Rights Violations in the Garment Industry
- 4. Case Studies
- 5. Root Causes
- 6. Significant Initiatives & Recommendations



Historical Framework

18th Century Industrial Revolution 19th Century "Sweatshop Culture" 1960-2005 LTA & MFA Global North -> Global South









New machine tools and the development of the factory system Employees are hired by factories, offering cheap labour while working in unsafe conditions

Efforts to control the clothing industries by limiting the quantity of clothing exports from developing countries into industrialized ones

Companies began to move their production to overseas factories searching for low-cost labour





3 Components of Fast-Fashion

- 1. A fashionable product design
- 2. Short production time
- 3. Low prices



Legal Framework

Important Guidelines & Declarations

1976 - OECD Guidelines:

Recommendations to companies on how to conduct in areas, such as human rights, environment, and how to avoid engagement in exploitation.

1977 - ILO Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises -> 2017 Revision (MNE Declaration):

Influenced by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948).

1998 - ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work:

Represents the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

2011 - United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights (UNGPs):

Apply to all States and to all business enterprises, which have a duty to carry out human rights across their operations.



Four Critical Subjects & their ILO Fundamental Conventions

Freedom of association and the effective recognition of the right to collective bargaining

Conventions
No.87 and 98

Elimination of all forms of forced or compulsory labour

Conventions
No.29 and 105

Effective abolition of child labour

Conventions
No.138 and 182

Equal remuneration and the elimination of discrimination in employment

Conventions
No.100 and 111



Freedom of Association & the Right to Collective Bargaining

Workers have the right to form organizations to claim their rights

- UDHR (art. 20.1, 23.4)
- ICESCR (art. 8)
- ILO Conventions No. 87 & No. 98

In Bangalore, India, none of the 500,000 garment workers had signed a collective-bargaining agreement with a trade union, until 2017 (Minney, 2017).



India violates article 8 of ICESCR



Equal Remuneration & Non-discrimination in Employment

- UDHR (art. 2, 23.2)
- ICESCR (art. 3, 7.a)
- CEDAW
- ILO Conventions No. 100 (Equal remuneration) & No. 111 (Discrimination in Employment & Occupation)

In 2017 women's employment in the garment factories reached 36.4 percent in Bangladesh. Bangladeshi women workers are often young, unmarried, and employed in the production sector, working as dressmakers, receive low pay, and have highly insecure employment.



Bangladesh violates CEDAW & ILO Conv. No. 100 & 111



Mistreatment

'My line manager made sexual advances, and after two years I couldn't stand it any more and left, losing all my benefits'

- Seema, a garment worker in India (Minney, 2017, p.91)

ILO 'Convention on Violence and Harassment' and its non-binding recommendation: Not inforce in any state.

'Everyone has the right to a world of work free from violence and harassment' (C190, art. 4.1)

Forced or Compulsory Labour

Forced or compulsory labour:

"all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered her or himself voluntarily"

- Forced Labour
 Convention (No. 29) and its Protocol
- Abolition of Forced Labour Convention (No. 105)

In China, forced labour within garment factories is expressed through excessive overtime work. As fashion brands require orders in a pretty limited time, workers strive to deliver on time, working in some extreme cases from 7.30 am to 2.00, or 3.00 am, with just a small break for sleep.



China has not ratified any of the ILO Conventions (Co. 29 & C105)





- CRC (art. 32.1)
- ICESCR (art. 10.3)
- Minimum Age Convention (C138)
- Worst Forms of Child Labour Conventions (C182)

Child Labour

Approximately 17 million children work in South Asia, and nearly 10 million are under 15. As in women's case, children constitute cheap labour because their wages are meager.

In Bangladesh children between the age of 16 and 18, are allowed to work in a garment factory, but legally no more than five hours.



Bangladesh violates article 32 of CRC, article 10 of ICESCR & ILO Convention No. 182



- UDHR (art. 23.3)
- ICESCR (art. 6.1, 7.1)
- Protection of Wages Convention (No. 95)
- Minimum Wage Fixing Convention (No. 131)
- Protection of Workers' Claims (Employer's Insolvency) Convention (No. 173)

Wages

According to a 2014 Research from the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific in Pakistan and Cambodia, the highest minimum wage applicable to unskilled garment workers is almost \$100 per month, whereas, in Bangladesh, this rate is about \$50. China is moving at the same levels, providing monthly minimum wages between \$150 and over \$200 in the lowest and highest rates, respectively (Luebker, 2014).



An insufficient wage deprives of workers the right to education, adequate food, clothing, housing, and the right to improve living conditions.

The legal limit of working hours is 48 hours per week and 8 hours per day, while when the overtime is being paid, the maximum limit of a working week can reach 60 hours (Co. 1).

- UDHR (art. 24)
- ICESCR (art. 7)
- Hours of Work (Industry) Convention (No. 1)
- Weekly Rest (Industry) Convention (No. 14)
- Forty-Hour Week Convention (No. 47)
- Holidays with Pay Convention(No. 132)
- Reduction of Hours of Work(No. 116
- Night Work Convention (No. 171)

Working Hours

In 1997, workers at Quality Factory in Cambodia were working for 13 to 15 hours a day, whereas the management officers were forcing them to sign 'voluntary' overtime requests. In case they refused to sign or failed to work overtime, they faced punishment or loss of a job. Like many garment factories in Cambodia, the Quality demanded their employees to work 7 days a week, with no day-off on Sundays.



Cambodia violated art. 7 of ICESCR, although it was ratified in 1992



- UDHR (art. 22)
- ICESCR (art. 9)
- Convention No. 102 (Social Security (Minimum Standards) Convention
- Equality of Treatment (Social Security)
 Convention(C118)
- Maintenance of Social Security Rights
 Convention

Social Security

The most usually violated human rights governing social protection within the clothing-production workplace include maternity-based discrimination, informal contracts, lack of health-care protection, and work-based injuries.

As garment workers have essentially short-term contracts or work irregularly, they do not receive any compensation that must be given for workplace damages.

Migrant Workers

- International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (art. 5.i,ii)
- Migration for Employment Convention
- Migrant Workers (Supplementary Provisions) Convention' No. 143

In Chinese garment production, workers at almost all the points, from bosses to sewing-machine operators, are migrants (Cline, 2013, p.144).

Taking into account that most migrant workers have temporal status, they are particularly exposed to various forms of compulsory labour (Niebank, 2018).

Racist attacks and exploitation due to lack of correct documentation are also among the violations of migrant workers' rights.





- ICESCR (art. 7)
- Promotional Framework for Occupational Safety and Health Convention' of 2006 (No. 187)
- Occupational Safety and Health Convention' of 1981 (No. 155) and its Protocol of 2002
- Occupational Health Services Convention' (No. 161)

Occupational Safety & Health

In 2011 the Ranas decided to build two additional floors in their apparel factory, called Rana Plaza, in Bangladesh. Rana Plaza contained several clothing-production floors manufactured for fast-fashion companies such as the British chain Primark, and the Italian Benetton.

On 24 April 2013, the eight-story factory dropped, resulting in the loss of over 1.100 lives and about 2.500 serious injuries, most of whom were women and children.

In this case government authorities ignored not only the extra floors' illegal establishment but also the crack marks in the building the day before.

Let's talk about Responsibility

The Effects of Globalisation

The Responsibility of the Production

Countries

Corporate Responsibility



Main Conclusions

- Comprehensive laws at the international level exist, but they are not enforced in most clothing factories
- Fashion companies are only required to publish a statement on the steps they are taking to prevent labour workers' exploitation.

Our buying behavior has the strength either to reinforce exploitation or promote progress in a way that respects human dignity

Thank you!

Do you have any questions?

Konstantina Papadopoulou



References - Primary Resources

Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), ASEAN Human Rights Declaration, 18 November 2012, Available at : https://www.asean.org/storage/images/ASEAN_RTK_2014/6_AHRD_Booklet.pdf

International Labour Organization (ILO) & Better Work (2020) 'Gendered Impacts Of COVID-19 On The Garment Sector', International Labour Organization (ILO), pp.1-9, [Online].

Available at: https://www.ilo.org/asia/publications/WCMS_760374/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 17

January 2021)

International Labour Organization (ILO) Violence and Harassment Convention, 2019, C190, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 18 January 2021)

International Labour Organization (2016) 'What is a minimum wage', *International Labour Organization Minimum Wage policy guide*, [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/wages/minimum-wages/definition/WCMS_439072/lang--en//index.htm (Accessed: 11 December 2020)

International Labor Office-Sectoral Activities Department (2014) Wages and working hours in the textiles, clothing, leather and footwear industries. Geneva: ILO Publications, pp 1-35

International Labour Organization (2014) Guide To International Labour Standards, Turin: ITC, pp.1-315.

International Labour Organization (ILO), Protocol of 2014 to the Forced Labour Convention, 2014, P029, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999, C182, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Minimum Age Convention, 1973, C138, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Minimum Wage Fixing Convention, 1970, C131, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed : 11 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Equality of Treatment (Social Security) Convention, 1962, C118, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dvn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention, 1958, C111, Available

International Labour Organization (ILO), Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957, C105, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951, C100, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO::: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

International Labour Organization (ILO), Convention concerning the Protection of Wages, 1949, C095, Available at: <a href="https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::NO:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f/p=1000::0.com/dyn/normlex/en/f/p=1000::0.com

International Labour Organization (ILO), Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949, C098, Available at:

International Labour Organization (ILO), Freedom Of Association And Protection Of The Right To Organize Convention, 1948, C087, Available a https://www.ilo.gra/dvip/gormlov/on/f2p=1000:12000::NO: (Association And Protection Of The Right To Organize Convention, 1948, C087, Available a

International Labour Organization (ILO), Forced Labour Convention, 1930, C029, Available at: https://www.ilo.org/dyn/normlex/en/f?p=1000:12000:::NO: (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.da) Introduction To International Labour Standards. [Online]. Available at:

ILO.org. (n.db) How International Labour Standards are created. [Online]. Available at:

ILO.org. (n.dc) How International Labour Standards are used. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/alobal/standards/introduction-to-international-labour-standards/international-labour-standards-use/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 5 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dd) ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/declaration/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 6 Decembe 2020)

LO.org. (n.de) Tripartite Declaration of Principles concerning Multinational Enterprises and Social Policy (MNE Declaration) - 5th Edition (2017. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/empent/areas/mne-declaration/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 6 December 2020)

LO.org. (n.df) Conventions and Recommendations. [Online]. available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/introduction-to-international-labour-standards/convention-ns-and-recommendations/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 6 December 2020).

ILO.org. (n.dg) *Subjects covered by International Labour Standards*. [Online]. available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/lang
--en/index.htm (Accessed: 8 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dh) International Labour Standards on Freedom of association. [Online]. Available at:

https://www.ilo.org/qlobal/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/free dom-of-association/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 9 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.di) International Labour Standards on Forced labour. [Online]. Available at:
https://www.ilo.org/qlobal/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/forc ed-labour/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dj) International Labour Standards on Child labour. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/child -labour/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dk) International Labour Standards on Equality of opportunity and treatment. [Online]. Available at:
https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/equa-lity-of-opportunity-and-treatment/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dl) International Labour Standards on Wages. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/wages/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 10 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dm) International Labour Standards on Working time. [Online]. Available at:
https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/wor king-time/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 12 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dn) International Labour Standards on Occupational Safety and Health. [Online]. Available at:

https://www.ilo.org/qlobal/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/occupational-safety-and-health/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 12 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.do) International Labour Standards on Social security. [Online]. Available at:
https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/social-security/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed:12 December 2020

ILO.org. (n.dp) International Labour Standards on Migrant workers. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/global/standards/subjects-covered-by-international-labour-standards/migrant-workers/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed:12 December 2020)

ILO.org. (n.dq) International labour standard instruments on maternity protection. [Online]. Available at: https://www.ilo.org/travail/aboutus/WCMS_119238/lang--en/index.htm (Accessed: 21 January 2021)

UNITED NATIONS (2011) Guiding principles on business and human rights: implementing the United Nations. Protect, Respect and Remedy framework.

UN General Assembly, International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, 18 December 1990, A/RES/45/158, Available at: https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cmw.aspx (Accessed: 20 December 2020)

UN General Assembly, Convention on the Rights of the Child, 20 November 1989, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1577, Available at

UN General Assembly, Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, 18 December 1979, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1249, Available at https://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CEDAW.aspx (Accessed: 12 December 2020)

UN General Assembly, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 16 December 1966, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 993, Available at: https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cescr.aspx (Accessed: 12 January 2021)

UN General Assembly, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 16 December 1966, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 999, Available at: https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/ccpr.aspx (Accessed: 13 January 2021)

UN General Assembly, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, 21 December 1965, United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 660, Available at: https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cerd.aspx (Accessed: 13 January 2021)

UN General Assembly, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 10 December 1948, 217 A (III), Available at: https://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/ (Accessed:12 December 2020)

U.S. Customs and Border Protection (2014) NAFTA: A Guide to Customs Procedures. [Online] Available at: https://www.cbp.gov/trade/nafta/a-guide-to-customs-procedures (Accessed: 25 May 2021)

Wto.org. (n.da) WTO | Understanding the WTO - Textiles: back in the mainstream. [Online] Available at: https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/agrm5_e.htm (Accessed: 25 May 2021)

Wto.org. (ndb) WTO | Understanding the WTO - The Uruguay Round. [Online] Available at: < https://www.wto.org/english/thewto_e/whatis_e/tif_e/fact5_e.htm > (Accessed: 25 May 2021)

References - Scientific Researches

Aishwariya S. (2019) 'High Cost Of Cheap Fashion', Apparel Views, 18(9), pp. 40-41

Alamgir, F. and Alakavuklar, O. (2018) Compliance Codes and Women Workers (Mis)representation and (Non)recognition in the Apparel Industry of Bangladesh', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 165(2), pp.295-310.

Anguelov, N. (2016) The Dirty Side Of The Garment Industry: Fast Fashion and Its Negative Impact on Environment and Society. Boca Raton: CRC Press.

Betterwork.org. (2021) The Programme – Better Work [Online]. Available at: https://betterwork.org/about-us/the-programme/ (Accessed 28 February 2021)

Bhardwaj, V. and Fairhurst, A. (2010) 'Fast fashion: response to changes in the fashion industry', The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research, 20(1) pp.165-173.

Brooks, A. (2015) Clothing Poverty: The Hidden World Of Fast Fashion And Second-Hand Clothes. London, UK: Zed Books Ltd.

Brunn, C. and Scherf, C. (2017) 'Case Study On The Governance Of Labour Standards In Bangladesh'S Garment Industry', Oeko-Institut's Working Paper Series, Oeko-Institut e.V.

Centre for Research on Multinational Corporations (SOMO) & Clean Clothes Campaign (CCC) (2013) 'Fatal Fashion, Analysis Of Recent Factory Fires In Pakistan And Bangladesh: A Call To Protect And Respect Garment Workers' Lives', Stichting Onderzoek Multinationale Ondernemingen (SOMO) Centre for Research on Multinational Corporations, pp.1-70.

Cline, E. (2013) Overdressed. New York: Portfolio/Penguin

De Neve, G. and Prentice, R. (2017) 'Introduction: Rethinking Garment Workers Health and Safety' in G. De Neve and R. Prentice, (ed.) *Unmaking the Global Sweatshop*. PHILADELPHIA: University of Pennsylvania Press, pp.1-26.

European Center for Constitutional and Human Rights (ECCHR) (2021) Case Report, Pakistan - cheap clothes, perilous conditions. European Center for Constitutional and Human Rights (ECCHR).

Garwood, S. (2005) 'Politics at work: Transnational advocacy networks and the global garment industry', Gender & Development, 13(3), pp.21-33.

Gibbs, A., Jewkes, R., Willan, S., Al Mamun, M., Parvin, K., Yu, M. and Naved, R. (2019) 'Workplace violence in Bangladesh's garment industry', Social Science & Medicine, 235, pp.1-10.

Governing Body of the International Labour Office (2017) *Tripartite Declaration Of Principles Concerning Multinational Enterprises And Social Policy.* Geneva: International Labour Office.

Hall, J. A. (2000) 'Human Rights and the Garment Industry in Contemporary Cambodia' Stanford Journal of International Law, 36(1), pp.119-174.

Islam, M. and McPhail, K. (2011) 'Regulating for corporate human rights abuses: The emergence of corporate reporting on the ILO's human rights standards within the global garment manufacturing and retail industry', *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, 22(8), pp.790-810.

Julie McCarthy (2013) Bangladesh Collapse: The Garment Workers Who Survived. [Online]. Available at: https://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2013/07/10/200644781/Bangladesh-Collapse-The-Gar ment-Workers-Who-Survived (Accessed: 4 January 2020)

Leslie D. (2002) 'Gender, Retail Employment and the Clothing Commodity Chain', Gender, Place and Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography, 9(1), pp.61-76.

Luebker, M. (2014) Minimum Wages In The Global Garment Industry. International Labour Organization.

Matsuura A. & Teng C. (2020) Understanding the Gender Composition and Experience of Ready-Made Garment (RMG) Workers in Bangladesh. International Labour Organization.

Minney, S. (2017) Slave To Fashion. Oxford, United Kingdom: New Internationalist Publications Ltd.

Niebank, J. (2018) Bringing Human Rights Into Fashion Issues, Challenges And Underused Potentials In The Transnational Garment Industry. Berlin: German Institute for Human Rights.

Nielsen, M. (2005) 'The Politics of Corporate Responsibility and Child Labour in the Bangladeshi Garment Industry', Royal Institute of International Affairs, 81(3), pp.559-580.

Sánchez Caldentey, L. (2018) European Textile Industry And Human Rights Due Diligence: Key Developments, Human Rights Allegations & Best Practices. Business & Human Rights Resource Centre.

Siddiqui, J. and Uddin, S. (2016) 'Human rights disasters, corporate accountability and the state', Accounting, Auditing & Accountability Journal, 29(4), pp.679-704

Solidaridad-South & South East Asia (2012) Understanding the Characteristics of the Sumangali Scheme in Tamil Nadu Textile & Garment Industry and Supply Chain Linkages FAIR Labour Association. (Protecting Workers' Rights Worldwide).

The True Cost (2015) The True Cost. [Online] Available at: https://truecostmovie.com/ (Accessed 25 May 2021)

Thomas D. (2019) Fashionopolis. New York: Penguin Press.